

Day 22: Implementation, Failure and Learning

Daniel J. Mallinson

School of Public Affairs
Penn State Harrisburg
mallinson@psu.edu

PUBPL 304

Today's Objectives

- 1 Understand the differences between viewing implementation from the top down and the bottom up
- 2 Understand the advantages and disadvantages of discretion held by street-level bureaucrats

Let's Hear from the Man Himself

https://youtu.be/qxL3ZFBSASw?si=MG365__Lof7_qGRC

Understanding Policy Implementation

Two Approaches

Top-Down

- Goals are clear
- Tools clearly defined
- Single Statute
- Implementation chain
- Easier to study

Bottom-Up

- Goals are ambiguous
- No single policy
- Politics continues during implementation
- Network of implementers
- More complicated to study

Third Approach: Integrate the two

When in Doubt?

Implementation of post-ACA menu labeling requirements.

Does it apply to restaurants only?

“The bill said... if you have twenty vending machines or more ... or twenty restaurants or more you have to post [menu labeling]. Then the grocery stores and bowling allies and movie theaters questioned whether or not they would be covered. And they actually did not want to be covered because they don't think of themselves as restaurants.”

From Brock, Farmed Out, page 91

Ask!

“I recently saw [bill authors] wrote a letter to FDA saying ‘Oh now, we did intend for [them] to be covered. Let there be no mistake, we want them to be covered, we want this to be as broad as possible.’ so that’s an example where someone could have gone to them to say ‘We’d like you to clarify.’ ... So, there would be times when you would go back to members of Congress. It doesn’t mean that something is necessarily going to go that way, but it’s a tool to clarify what Congress intended.”

From Brock, Farmed Out, page 91

Street-Level Bureaucrats

- What is a street-level bureaucrat ([video](#))?
- With which have you had personal interactions?
- Do they have a great deal of implementation discretion?
- What are some examples of this discretion?
- Is it a good idea to give them discretion (in terms of program management and democratic politics)?