

# HIGHER EDUCATION IN REVIEW

**Volume 9  
2012**

*Higher Education in Review* is an annual publication of the Higher Education Student Association and is supported by the Center for the Study of Higher Education and the Department of Education Policy Studies at the Pennsylvania State University.

The content and opinions of this publication reside solely with the authors and not with the Pennsylvania State University or the University Park Allocation Committee.

ISSN 1556-5424

© 2012

<http://www.clubs.psu.edu/hesa/HER>

The paper used in this journal is certified by the Forest Stewardship  
Council as 100% post-consumer fiber.

Cover design by Alisha Fund. Photograph by Lisa Anne Sabol.

**Editorial Board**  
**Volume 9**  
**2012**

Editors

Rodney Hughes and Ezekiel Kimball

Managing Editor

David Knight

Associate Editors

Jessica Bennett – Production

Sarah Hoffman – Special Events

Jihee Hwang – Layout

Claude Mayo – Finance and Marketing

Jared Rodrigues – Website

Consulting Editors

Jennifer Eury

Rachel Frick-Cardelle

Claire Gilbert

Amanda Knerr

Karla Loya

Travis York

Symposium Coordinator

Emil Cunningham

Operations Coordinators

Michael Minutello

Charles Gibson

Technical Editors

Michael Flaherty

Eman Ibrahim El-Desouki Ahmed

Mary Chandy Vayaliparampil

Faculty Advisor

John J. Cheslock

## Review Board

Christian K. Anderson  
Assistant Professor, Higher Education  
University of South Carolina  
Past Editor, *Higher Education in Review*

Kevin Barron  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

John J. Cheslock  
Associate Professor, Higher  
Education  
Senior Research Associate, Center for  
the Study of Higher Education  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Faculty Advisor,

Augustus Colangelo  
Associate Dean for Undergraduate  
Education and Director of Outreach  
The Pennsylvania State University

Bradley E. Cox  
Assistant Professor, Educational  
Leadership and Policy Studies  
The Florida State University  
Past Editor, *Higher Education in Review*

Jennifer Domagal-Goldman  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Past Editor, *Higher Education in Review*

Wilfredo Del Pilar Jr.  
Office of the Vice Provost for  
Educational Equity  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Past Managing Editor, *Higher Education in Review*

Robert J. Domingo  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Past President, Higher Education  
Student Association

Andrea L. Dowhower  
Assistant Vice President for Student  
Affairs  
The Pennsylvania State University

William R. Doyle  
Assistant Professor, Higher Education  
Vanderbilt University

Greg Dubrow  
Adjunct Professor at Stanford  
University  
Director, Research & Policy Analysis  
Office of Undergraduate Admissions  
University of California, Berkeley

Evelyn M. Ellis  
Director, Office of Institutional  
Diversity and Equity  
Dartmouth College

Dorothy H. Evensen  
Professor, Higher Education  
Senior Research Associate, Center for  
the Study of Higher Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Melanie Fedri  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Phillip W. Feerrar  
Faculty Member  
Academy of the New Church

Roger G. Gonzalez  
Assistant Professor, Higher Education  
Program  
Florida International University

Kimberly Griffin  
Assistant Professor, College Student  
Affairs and Higher Education  
Research Associate, Center for the  
Study of Higher Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Betty J. Harper  
Senior Planning and Research  
Associate, Planning and Institutional  
Assessment  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Past Editor, *Higher Education in  
Review*

James T. Harris III  
President  
Widener University

Donald E. Heller  
Professor of Higher, Adult, and

Lifelong Education  
Dean of the College of Education  
Michigan State University

Robert M. Hendrickson  
Professor, Higher Education  
Senior Research Associate, Center for  
the Study of Higher Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Suzanne Hickey  
Earned Doctorate, Higher Education  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Past President, Higher Education  
Student Association

Stanley O. Ikenberry  
Professor and Senior Scientist, Center  
for the Study of Higher Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Emily M. Janke  
Assistant Director, Student Learning  
Office of Student Affairs  
University of North Carolina-  
Greensboro

Issam Khoury  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Mark Lafer  
Senior Policy Analyst, American  
Education Services  
Pennsylvania Higher Education  
Assistance Agency

Lisa R. Lattuca  
Professor, School of Education  
University of Michigan

Brenda Lutovsky Quayle  
Assistant Director, Office of Student  
Conduct  
University of Maryland

India McHale  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Past Marketing and Distribution  
Coordinator, *Higher Education in  
Review*

Kadian McIntosh  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Past Co-Director, *Higher Education  
in Review Online*

Michael K. McLendon  
Associate Dean and Chief of Staff,  
Associate Professor of Public Policy  
and Higher Education  
Vanderbilt University

Peter Moran  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University  
Past Editor, *Higher Education in  
Review*

David M. Post  
Professor, Higher Education  
Senior Research Associate, Center for  
the Study of Higher Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Robert D. Reason  
Associate Professor of Student  
Affairs and Higher Education  
Iowa State University  
Former Faculty Advisor, *Higher  
Education in Review*

Susan R. Richardson  
Principal  
Education by the Numbers, LLC

Hyun Kyoung Ro  
Research Designer and Analyst,  
Institutional Research & Analysis  
Carnegie Mellon University  
Creso Sá  
Assistant Professor, Higher Education  
University of Toronto  
Past Editor, *Higher Education in  
Review*

Carl H. Sorgen IV  
Doctoral Candidate, Higher  
Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Rishi Sririam  
Visiting Instructor and Program  
Coordinator, Higher Education and  
Student Affairs, Educational  
Administration  
Baylor University

Vicki L. Sweitzer  
Assistant Professor, Economics and  
Management  
Albion College

David A. Tandberg  
Assistant Professor of Higher  
Education  
The Florida State University  
Past Editor, *Higher Education in  
Review*

J. Fredricks Volkwein  
Professor Emeritus, Higher Education  
Senior Scientist, Center for the Study  
of Higher Education  
The Pennsylvania State University

Gary W. White  
Head of the Department of Reference,  
Collections, and Research, University  
Libraries  
The Pennsylvania State University

Tara Scales Williams  
Director, Multicultural Resource  
Center  
The Pennsylvania State University

James K. Woodell  
Doctoral Candidate  
The Pennsylvania State University  
President, Higher Education Student  
Association  
Past Web Editor, *Higher Education in  
Review*

Alexander Yin  
Senior Planning and Research  
Associate, Planning and Institutional  
Assessment  
The Pennsylvania State University

## Information for Contributors

*Higher Education in Review* is an independent, refereed journal published by graduate students of the Higher Education program at the Pennsylvania State University. Our mission is to make a substantive contribution to the higher education literature through the publication of high-quality research studies, scholarly papers, and literature reviews in areas related to the university, the four-year college, and the community college. In so doing, we provide graduate students first-hand experience with the publishing process.

*Higher Education in Review* (print edition) welcomes manuscripts that employ qualitative, quantitative, or mixed methods; literature reviews that disclose relevant gaps in existing research on a relevant topic; theoretical analyses of important issues in higher education; policy analysis papers; reports of preliminary findings from a larger project (e.g., a dissertation); and historical papers. Submitted papers should have a clearly specified research question and a theoretical or conceptual framework, employ appropriate methods, and contribute new knowledge to the body of the higher education literature. Submissions are accepted year-round, with annual publication in April.

Please visit our website, <http://www.clubs.psu.edu/up/hesa/HER/>, for complete submission guidelines. Manuscripts should be submitted as Microsoft Word documents to [HigherEducationInReview@psu.edu](mailto:HigherEducationInReview@psu.edu).



# HIGHER EDUCATION IN REVIEW

**Volume 9**  
**2012**

*Editors' Introduction*.....i

## ARTICLES

*Crossing Boundaries: Mass Higher Education in Multiple Perspectives*.....1  
Sir Peter Scott

*A Longitudinal Analysis of Organizational Determinants of Part-time Faculty Employment in Private Baccalaureate Colleges and Universities*.....15  
Natasha Rummyantseva

*Leadership in Crisis: A Historical Analysis of Two College Presidencies in Reconstruction Virginia*.....39  
L. Neal Holly and Jeremy P. Martin

*Reaching Out, Connecting Within: Community Service and Sense of Belonging Among College Students*.....67  
Krista M. Soria, Jordan N. Troisi, and Michael J. Stebleton



## Editors' Notes

With the writing of this piece, we have the privilege of bringing to a close what has proven to be a most interesting volume of *Higher Education in Review*. This year we have received the largest number of submitted pieces in the history of our publication, and we have been faced with some of the most difficult editorial decisions we have encountered thus far. The pieces that we have selected are of a uniformly high quality, even as they push the bounds of higher education scholarship in very different ways. The fact that it is customary to make a statement of this sort herein makes it no less true.

Indeed, the belief that it is the work of graduate students and early career scholars of higher education to challenge the status quo and find new ways to represent the past, present, and future of higher education has long been the hallmark of *Higher Education in Review*. In our editorial board meetings, we often found ourselves remarking upon our great fortune to be able to read and support pieces on so many different topics and in so many different forms. All, however, share a common theme—"Crossing Boundaries"—and it is a theme that the journal will carry forward into our next volume as well, a volume that will mark the tenth anniversary of *Higher Education in Review*.

We think of the theme of "Crossing Boundaries" quite broadly. It could mean a new form of analysis, theory, or method. It could mean a focus on a topic that is not typically a part of our scholarly discourse. Or, it could mean that a piece draws upon disparate literature bases and synthesizes them in a way that makes each even richer than it was before. Simply put, when we speak of "Crossing Boundaries," we speak of construction and reconstruction of knowledge in a way that helps us to understand students, colleges and universities, and society as a whole in a richer, more fully realized way. But when we speak of "Crossing Boundaries," we also wish to remind the reader of the destination—the fact that in breaking through a barrier you end up someplace, and often in commonality with someone else, that you were not before. And in this taking up of new perspectives and in the dialogue with scholars of different points of view, we gain the potential to understand our own work in new ways. As is also customary in an editor's introduction, we hope that the readers will forgive us a brief personal anecdote to demonstrate exactly what we mean here.

We—the editors of this volume—are radically different scholars. Rodney was trained in economics and employs statistical models to better understand the college choice process and the operations of higher education

institutions. Zeke's disciplinary homes are history and social theory. Much of his work, which concentrates on college access and student development, is highly qualitative in nature. Under normal circumstances, we might not think to work with one another since our approaches—if not our interests—are quite different.

In the Spring of 2010, however, we both enrolled in the same graduate seminar focused on interdisciplinarity. For each of us, one of the key pieces that we read focused on the creation of “common ground” in interdisciplinary undertakings (Bromme, 2000). To reduce what is a very thoughtful chapter to a few brief words, the piece demonstrates that successful interdisciplinary collaborations, which by their very nature aim for the creation of new knowledge, are predicated on the creation of shared values, beliefs, assumptions, language, and research problems. They require all the parties engaged in interdisciplinary work to engage in the work of “Crossing Boundaries.”

As we have been editing this volume, we too have been searching for common ground as we grappled with our shared interest in college-going, which we describe as encompassing both access and choice. As we engaged in this thinking, we came to believe that we understand college-going wrongly—or at least incompletely—when we focus on either access or choice in isolation and instead must look at both simultaneously.

The dominant models of college choice, for example, focus on student behavior within an admissions marketplace that is assumed to be largely static. In contrast, college access models tend to be dominated by a focus on how institutional and societal structures sort students into different types of institutions. Surely, though, the behavior of individual students impacts the behavior of institutions. And just as surely, students do not passively accept structural determinations of the sort of institutions that they might access. Instead, both students and institutions actively seek to shape the behavior of the other via a process that we have come to call “dual commodification.”

We share this example not because we think it is in any way remarkable but because we think of it as very typical. It is entirely representative of the sort of intellectual work that each of our authors has undertaken in their work, a summary of which we have neglected for too long now. Natasha Rumyantseva applies an organizational sociology perspective and a panel data set spanning 14 years to build on previous economic analysis and identify correlates with part-time faculty utilization in private colleges and universities. L. Neal Holly and Jeremy P. Martin focus a historical lens on two institutional leaders outside the mainstream in the scholarship on the history of higher education, Robert E. Lee at Washington College and

Benjamin Stoddert Ewell at the College of William and Mary, during the Reconstruction. Krista M. Soria, Jordan N. Troisi, and Michael J. Stebleton apply regression analysis to data from the Student Experience in the Research University data set to examine the relationship between participation in community service and sense of belonging at an institution. Sir Peter Scott, in our invited work, addresses the theme of boundary crossing in multiple ways, weaving together a narrative of personal boundary crossing with an examination of changes affecting higher education at large.

We have been honored to serve as editors of this volume of *Higher Education in Review* and to have learned from our authors and fellow editorial board members. Though we know that many of them will continue their affiliation with the journal in coming years, we are particularly pleased to be able to announce that two of their number—Travis York and Jessica Bennett—have been selected to serve as Editor and Senior Associate Editor respectively. In their very capable hands (and minds), *Higher Education in Review* is well poised to continue its tradition of “Crossing Boundaries.”

Rodney Hughes and Ezekiel Kimball, Editors

## References

- Bromme, R. (2000). Beyond one's own perspective: The psychology of cognitive interdisciplinarity. In P. Weingart & N. Stehr (Eds.), *Practicing Interdisciplinarity* (116- 133). Toronto, Canada: Toronto University Press.

